

Submitted On	Name	In your opinion what should be done with the Monuments	Message
03/02/2018 8:22:28	Leanne Seward	Leave the monuments as they are., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	Visitors of the monuments spend millions every year in Richmond. It doesn't make sense to spend money removing something that contributes extra money and visitors to Richmond. If you are going to spend money then possibly add more monuments that may attract even more visitors to Richmond and monument Ave. We are talking about feelings vs money and I think we need to be practical and not WASTE tax dollars.
03/02/2018 11:43:42	Jarold Apple	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	I am a historic preservationist. Monument Avenue is a National Historic Landmark, the highest designation our nation gives for our historic places. I believe it is important to preserve our nation's historic places - all of them, not just those which are part of a happy or solely positive history - so that we may learn from our history. The history of the monuments on Monument Avenue is directly tied to their location and place, and any removal or relocation would diminish their historic integrity and value. Instead, I share the sentiments of many other historic preservationists in arguing for the addition of helpful and informative context - educational signs and information for visitors, as well as the addition of new monuments and art that tells a fuller and more broad story of Richmond's history, including the history of the Civil War, slavery, and Jim Crow. Richmond has an opportunity to lead the nation in this regard, setting an example for historic preservation that truly educates.
03/02/2018 18:19:16	Harry Thompson	Leave the monuments as they are.	Please respect the history and respect the persons who fought on behalf of there state and home
03/02/2018 20:09:04	Jennifer Garvin-Sanchez	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	Public art, especially monuments, are a way to shape and mold a society's dreams and deepest held beliefs about the community. It doesn't matter if the average person knows the details of the history or not—the broader message gets across. These people on horseback are our saints and heroes. They are our ideal of what kind of society we wanted to be--and lost —they were and are the mold of our values and vision of ourselves. The myth of the lost cause says to our children—these heroes are models of our highest ideals: honor and our southern way of life based on slavery and racism. This message is reinforced every time someone walks or drives down Monument Ave. Constructed during Jim Crow to mark segregated areas, it says to white southerners, look, here are our ancestors who fought to keep this southern way of life. It says to black southerners, look how much we fought to make sure that you stayed slaves, and even though we lost, you better not even think of moving to this section of town. This is the message that gets communicated.
03/06/2018 16:27:20	bill grogan	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	I sent a letter to Editor -RT-D with suggestions I will fwd it if you give me your e-mail address. I would like to attende the meetings , but cannot get a correct schedule . I tried to attend the Friday meeting at 3500 Patterson Ave , but found there is no 3500 Patterson Ave. Albert Hill School is located at what should be 3500.
03/08/2018 13:59:34	David Rafner		Are there any minutes or summaries of past meetings available?
03/08/2018 14:55:13	Donald Baker	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	When is the meeting with MAPS? Thx.
03/10/2018 10:52:38	Carlisle Branch	Leave the monuments as they are.	I think th PC crowd is displaying their hatred for a large segment of the population and their hatred is not going to foster understanding. The monuments are not monuments to slavery. They are monuments to the people who gave their all for their fellow countrymen. The city has plenty of places to honor other people and ideas. Why waste resources tearing down what is there only to end up with a new monument avenue when you can build new elsewhere and have two monument avenues?

03/11/2018 23:47:13	Paul Sherman	Add context to the monuments.	I found this to be a spectacular idea that might be of value to you. https://www.npr.org/2012/05/31/153943491/stumbling-upon-miniature-memorials-to-nazi-victims
03/12/2018 12:19:11	Vivian Keasler	Add context to the monuments.	We are different from other cities that have Confederate monuments. Because this was the capital of the Confederacy, people come here to study the war. Our entire city is a museum and educational resource for all Americans.
03/13/2018 2:30:19	paul smith	Relocate the monuments.	so many battlefield sites lack significant markers. consider the relocation of monuments to battlefield sites as a representation of historical fact of where history played out. Replace the monuments with state, national, or international (gifts-art)) which represent a new day of inspiration and a new reality of a united country. This approach could be broadened to a national reallocation of monuments without denying history. Monuments could relocated to Gettysburg. The national collection of Smithsonian resorces could be tapped or various groups could be afforded the opportunity to contribute a monument within historical content criteria. Such a national movement may be a win-win in confining the issues to a historical context
03/13/2018 13:22:13	Jennie Daley	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Relocate the monuments.	The veneration given these statues in their current location is a shame. There is no question in my mind that relocating them to another location where they can be given context is a more appropriate, and human, choice. The medians can become green space while a committee of stakeholders decides how to reappropriate the space along the avenue. Meanwhile, wherever the statues end up (the Civil War Museum comes to mind) can provide an opportunity for a broader conversation that allows Richmond to publicly, and constructively, address its past as a means of freeing itself to fully embrace the exciting future ahead for this city.
03/13/2018 17:13:30	Dolson Anderson		I would like to contact any member of the Commission to be our invited guest to speak with our Club members at our scheduled meeting 6:45 pm on April 9, 2018 at 2416 Chamberlayne Ave, Richmond, Virginia 23222. Astoria is a 117 year old organization in Richmond, Virginia that has been most responsible for the erection of the Bill "Bojangles" monument, the Boatman Statue on Brown's Island and the Maggie L. Walker Monument and Park. More about our organization can be found at https://www.astoriabeneficialclub.org/ My telephone contact is (804) 874-9273.
03/14/2018 14:21:20	Sharon Harrington	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	PLEASE PLEASE PLEASE remove the monuments. It is not open, caring, generous, hospitable or loving to our African American community members to have these atrocities. I'm white, 99.9% European background according to 23&Me, born in VA, and I get sick to my stomach when I drive past these horrors. They are oppressive to view and live near. They are chains of the past. They do not move this city forward. Their presence no doubt hurts our economic opportunity as a city. Also, please please please let the ACTUAL residents of Richmond VA have the largest vote in what happens within this city. Someone who lives in a surrounding county should not dictate how Richmonders live in a thriving community with other Richmonders. Relocate them if you can find someone to take them, but do not stop the removal process if you can't find someone who wants them. Also, can we PLEASE PLEASE PLEASE remove the daughters of the confederacy stuff from the VaFMA location?

03/14/2018 16:24:44	June M. W.	Leave the monuments as they are.	I do NOT support removing any of the Confederate statues in Richmond. My ancestor and his two brothers fought against the Confederate army at Antietam, Fredericksburg and at Gettysburg. They fought real flesh and blood men. I consider it a great slap in the face to dumb down our Civil War and make believe it was no big deal—a piece of cake—when in actuality, it took five long years and cost so many lives. Out of respect to the men who fought for the Union against the Confederacy, the monuments in Richmond must remain standing as they clearly represent the very strong (enemy) army the Union was up against. Men died fighting to save the Union; a noble cause. The Confederacy (also) represents the "rebel" that lives inside all of us, from children up to adulthood, and when we disagree with our government. They lost this war, but their determination is the attraction. That's why people today, all around the world are fascinated by our American Civil War veterans, on both sides of the conflict. Remove the monuments and you'll succeed in removing Richmond's real history.
03/27/2018 13:46:49	Ailsa Long	Leave the monuments as they are., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	I feel that these monuments are reflective of history, however painful that may be and the monuments should stay. But new monuments should be erected along Monument Avenue with additional context to reflect other leaders, champions, perspectives and that represent ALL PEOPLE that faced challenges and overcame during the civil war. I am an Architect-Urban Designer, trained in England, and understand the importance of displaying history in many mediums, and from all perspectives and angles.
03/27/2018 14:01:22	Noah Scalin	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	It's time for our city to move forward. The monuments are racist symbols that are a weight around our collective necks. To leave them (even in context) would only validate the ideologies they support. As other communities continue to remove their monuments will we be the last ones standing and become a beacon call to the racists across America saying, "Don't worry, we're on your side. Come here and make your stand!?" Images are powerful, and the removal of these monuments, while not ending racism or fixing our other problems, would make a major statement about what we value in our community and what kind of city we want to be in the future.
03/27/2018 14:03:36	Mim Scalin	Relocate the monuments.	Adding context will not be sufficient. Put the monuments in context, in museums, cemeteries, battlefields.

I regularly walk my dog a mile -- the length of Monument Avenue -- to the Robert E. Lee statue. That sculpture is beautiful. In 1991, it was the view out the window of my first job in town. I can't count the number of photos I've taken of it at sunset and sunrise. I walk Monument Avenue regularly. Those statues are in my neighborhood, blocks from my home, fixtures in my life. But they need to come down, starting with Jefferson Davis.

If those statues don't bother you it's because you come from a place of immense privilege.

Care to "put those statues in context"? Here's all the context you need: White supremacists and Neo-Nazis defend and celebrate those statues today. Heather Heyer lost her life to hate-filled individuals who defended statues such as those.

Those statues celebrate and revere people who sought to tear this country in two, who defended slavery as an institution and, indeed, owned slaves.

Jefferson Davis committed treason. Period.

The descendants of many of these memorialized men have come out, publicly, to say these statues need to come down. The family members of Robert E. Lee are among them.

Was Lee an honorable man? There are some strong arguments that suggest he was. Indeed, he wanted to abandon all vestiges of the Confederacy after the war. Read this: <https://www.thedailybeast.com/even-robert-e-lee-wanted-the-confederate-flag-gone>

EXCERPT: Lee did not want such divisive symbols following him to the grave. At his funeral in 1870, [Confederate] flags were notably absent from the procession. Former Confederate soldiers marching did not don their old military uniforms, and neither did the body they buried. "His Confederate uniform would have been 'treason' perhaps!" Lee's daughter wrote.

So sensitive was Lee during his final years with extinguishing the fiery passions of the Civil War that he opposed erecting monuments on the battlefields where the Southern soldiers under his command had fought against the Union. "I think it wiser moreover not to keep open the sores of war, but to follow the examples of those nations who endeavoured to obliterate the marks of civil strife and to commit to oblivion the feelings it engendered," he wrote.

The High Line is an incredibly popular and successful 1.45-mile-long elevated linear park and greenway in New York City.

Removing a bunch of treasonous 2nd place trophies won't destroy RVA tourism or home values. On the contrary, if we replaced them with public art -- not just where Confederate statues now stand, but in the medians and greenways, all the way down Monument Avenue, we will create a tourism opportunity, just as the High Line did.

Arts leaders, including some at VCU's new Institute for Contemporary Art, can help lead this effort. Richmond will be celebrated as the "Capital of Creativity" instead of the "Capital of the Confederacy."

Already RVA is celebrated for its world-class art museums, the #1 public art school in the nation, a thriving arts and creative scene with makers and advertisers and artists of all kinds thriving here. What better way to advance that movement than by putting a world-class sculpture garden down the length of Monument Avenue and changing our city's divisive narrative?

These statues can and will find a more appropriate home in a Confederate museum or on a Confederate battlefield. As @RVAwonk (Caroline O.) once said on Twitter: "Taking down

Remove the monuments from

03/27/2018 14:20:18	Joshua Poteat	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	This is a difficult job but current and future residents surely appreciate you all addressing this issue. If the monuments aren't relocated or removed (a park with all the monuments together in one small area could be lovely), context needs to be added – actual markers/signs, an official website, billboards, video projectors, et al. Get history professors from local universities who specialize in the Civil War/post-Civil War to write the copy that will appear on said markers. Get architects/designers to design the markers in the most aesthetically pleasing, modern way. My first choice for a new monument addition is Gabriel. It should be one thousand feet tall.
03/27/2018 14:24:21	Edith Ridderhof	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	Relocate some (Stuart, Davis, Jackson) and replace with other Virginians. Add context to Lee and maybe Maury. Add more monuments for a variety of eras in Virginia history.
03/27/2018 14:31:45	Nico Cathcart	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	Lets relocate the monuments to a historical site, which is NOT on government land. Add some context in their final, more appropriate place, so that they serve as a historical monument of our past. I'd love to see those civil war monuments replaced by revolutionary war monuments, as well as some famous virginians who lead the civil rights movement.
03/27/2018 14:32:42	Robert Fisher	Leave the monuments as they are.	I believe the Monuments should be left as they are to remind us all and visitors to Richmond that we once differed so far that we had a civil war! May we live in peace and never go there again.
03/27/2018 14:54:22	Kevin Orlosky	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	If Richmond wants to be a world-class city it is important that we remove symbols of oppression from our identity. It is also important we don't forget that racism played a large roll in shaping our city so we do not repeat it. The monuments should be taken down. Replaced with new public art that engages and represents the entire community in Richmond. The monuments should be placed somewhere else and given the context of why and when they were erected to intimidate the rise of the black economy in Richmond.
03/27/2018 15:08:01	Terry Menefee Gau	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I believe we should replace the monuments with inclusive and diverse heroes that supported Richmond, even through the adversity of prejudice and discrimination. I would like to see the Confederate leadership moved to a museum to provide the necessary context, but I would like to see Arthur Ashe remain. We need heroes who represent who we are now. I'd like to see Lila Meade Valentine take the place of Jeff Davis. I'd like to see Peter Francisco take the place of Jeb Stuart. I'd like to see the Rev. John Jasper to take the place of Stonewall Jackson. And I'd like to see Maggie Walker take the place of Robert E. Lee. We have an opportunity now to create a vision of who we can be rather than celebrate the division we fought to maintain.
03/27/2018 15:08:19	Timothy Gearles	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	These monuments serve to "remember those who lost a struggle to enslave others". Heritage or not, hate should never be remembered through any celebration. We have museums dedicated to remembering the Holocaust, both good and bad, but you can choose to visit. Leaving these statues makes glorifying past U.S. atrocities compulsory.

03/27/2018 15:16:05	Lawrence Rafalko	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	<p>I moved to Richmond from New Jersey more than seven years ago. When I first saw the monuments, I found them shocking. I called friends from home to share my disbelief as I was looking at them. After being here for a while, I have become a bit desensitized to them but I will always remember my initial shock in seeing them. After discovering them as an outsider and then becoming a Richmond resident, I would favor removal because they give a negative impression of the city.</p> <p>I would never recommend adding additional statues. I have often thought that there is no way Arthur Ashe would have ever wanted to have a statue of himself mixed among that company. I wouldn't want to see other figures added to Monument Avenue in the same mildly insulting attempt to legitimize statues that were initially erected in the Jim Crow era. I also think an attempt to contextualize the statues would court new controversy.</p> <p>Monument Avenue will still be a beautiful street without the statues. The Confederate history of Richmond can no more be erased by the removal of the statues than it could be preserved by their initial creation.</p>
03/27/2018 15:21:10	Rachel Douglas	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	<p>These multiple options all could work. The main point is to publicly denounce slavery and Jim Crow that is currently celebrated by these monuments, and to publicly support the role that African Americans have played in building this city to be the great city it is, despite all the adversity and institutional racism that exists in our city. Whatever it is, it should be loud and unapologetic - we do not support the legacy of hate and hurt any longer. We celebrate and do our best to uncover the real history so we are not doomed to repeat it. Thank you for your work towards this effort!</p>
03/27/2018 15:43:39	Jessica McLean	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	<p>The monuments are racist. They were built to intimidate our black residents. Leaving them stand is racist. No amount of 'context' will change the facts that we fought a war for the right to own people. It's an embarrassment to our city. Not to mention the fact that they attract neo-nazis which pose a threat to our citizens.</p> <p>There are many Virginians worth honoring but they are not Confederates.</p>
03/27/2018 15:56:08	Karen Mullins		<p>I am not insistent that the monuments *must* be removed but would support any initiative to do so and if they remain, context and diversity balance should be added. That these monuments were erected concurrent with the dawn of Jim Crow is not lost on anyone.</p>
03/27/2018 16:00:59	Gabriel Reich	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	<p>I waver between removal and context. If the choice was leave them as they are or remove, I would say remove.</p> <p>If, however, we have the freedom to add context, I think that is also a workable solution, but the question is what context, and how should it be added?</p> <p>I have two proposals. I agree that some sort of signage that provides context about how, when and why the monuments were put up is important as it sets the record straight. The monuments were put up as a symbol of the power of white supremacy reasserting itself. No plaque with words, however, can equal the monumental status of the statues themselves. In addition to the plaques, I suggest three things: 1) the space around the Lee monument become a site for temporary art installations that juxtaposed with the Lee monument will cause passers-by to reflect on the Lee monument and why it is there; 2) Remove the Jefferson Davis Statue, it is creepy, fictional, and ugly; 3) In place of Davis add a statue. Some possibilities for a new statue is one to Sheppard Malory, James Townsend, and Frank Baker, three enslaved men who freed themselves by rowing to Ft. Monroe; or perhaps Mary Elizabeth Bowser an enslaved woman in RVA who spied for the Union. It would be really great if Davis was melted down and that metal used to cast a new statue.</p>

03/27/2018 16:16:20	heather watt	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments.	enough. move them to the museum of the confederacy. time to move on and evolve.
03/27/2018 16:21:01	Ann Furniss		Remove the riders; keep the horses. Statues are lovely and the horses aren't guilty.
03/27/2018 16:45:32	Karen Elizabeth Kelly	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	Add plaques to describe why and when these monuments were erected. The state should help pay for this. Add statues of other Richmond or Virginia notables to keep Monument Ave the important tourist attraction it is today. They should be paid for by groups who want to sponsor this new art, not the city! Until education, transportation and housing issues are corrected, new statues must be privately funded!!
03/27/2018 16:51:33	Mike Harrell	Relocate the monuments.	Relocate to Tredegar.
03/27/2018 17:05:24	Tracey St. Peter	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	The monuments were installed to assert White dominance, well after the Civil War had ended. They perpetuate a false narrative. They need to go. They have also recently been used by white supremacist hate groups to rally around. I would love for them to be reinstated at another site, where protests and rallies are easy to prevent. As it is they are beacons of hate, displayed prominently as if we don't know or care that they are actually hateful propaganda. The new site would allow viewing with context provided. Context as to who installed them and the agenda behind that. The original sin of slavery must be dealt with to clean the soul of Richmond. Moving the monuments from the heart of the city would go a long way in making Richmond a better city. It is time to do the right thing and move our city into the present with a clear road toward the future.
03/27/2018 17:06:53	Alysia Cw	Relocate the monuments.	Move them to a historical context or landmark.
03/27/2018 17:12:07	Susan Kang	Relocate the monuments.	The Confederate statues belong in a museum/historical setting. They negate positive aspirations of the people of Richmond, Virginia. To be honest, I feel, literally, sick when I pass by them, because I cannot forget the horrendous human suffering caused by the Civil War.. Best regards, Susan Jones Kang
03/27/2018 17:36:23	Melina Bezirdjian	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	www.sah.org/publications-and-research/sah-blog/sah-blog/2017/09/13/confederate-monuments-and-civic-values-in-the-wake-of-charlottesville
03/27/2018 17:41:39	Lora Toothman	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	I'm a descendant of people who owned enslaved people, and deeply believe that there is no room for the celebration of slavery, Jim Crow, and/or Massive Resistance in Richmond. The Confederate Generals memorialized on Monument Avenue were traitors to the United States. The CSA were liable not only for the blood of the men who fought in its army, but for that of the enslaved people on whose backs the South's economy was built. Remove those Monuments and raise new ones to the enslaved people who built Richmond, to the Native Americans whom we Europeans decimated, to women like Elizabeth Van Lew, who did what was right.
03/27/2018 17:44:08	Katarina Spears	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	It's time for Richmond to enter the 21st century.
03/27/2018 18:00:39	Frye David	Add context to the monuments.	I propose making them all into public pay toilets. Let all blacks use them for free and all whites pay double.
03/27/2018 18:10:55	Samantha Brown	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	Relocate the monuments to a museum

03/27/2018 18:12:02	Alison Auth	Leave the monuments as they are., Add context to the monuments.	History is a wise teacher. Let's use it. Add context to the monuments.
03/27/2018 18:17:56	Elizabeth Dickie	Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	The war happened, we cannot erase that. So add to the monuments. Maggie Walker, James Armistead Lafayette, Mary Elizabeth Bowser, and more. Tell everyone's story.
03/27/2018 18:27:16	Heidi Rugg	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	It is unacceptable that these monuments remain in such prominent positions. I have talk to my African-American friends and fervently believe that Removing the statues will catapult a healing process that has long been ignored.
03/27/2018 18:33:26	Dolores Fitzgerald	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	These statues were erected with the intent to oppress black people and elevate white supremacy; to symbolize and maintain the 'spirit' of slavery. The people depicted among them fought as traitors against our nation. They have no justification being on public lands and no justification being protected and regarded as 'monuments' or icons of the state. They must come down. To leave them up (even with added context) would indicate to the world that this city / this commonwealth / this government wishes to continue the false narratives concerning its role in slavery of the past and wishes to carry forward the ideas of racism into the future.
03/27/2018 19:31:07	Thea Brown	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	As a white women with a Black husband and biracial child, it saddens me to see the people that fought against the United States and for the continued enslavement of Black people gloried on Monument Avenue. There are so many noteworthy Richmonders we could celebrate instead
03/27/2018 20:03:10	Jessica Scalin	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	The monuments celebrate racism. It's sad that Richmond is so behind on this matter considering all that is happening in the States. Richmond should show that they too are leaders in diversity and are strong in standing against oppression. I'm embarrassed that this hasn't happened yet & that I see African American leaders in this community being ok with them still standing. I'm a white woman & I know they should come down; they should have never been put up on pedestals in the first place.
03/27/2018 20:28:12	Joan Oberle	Relocate the monuments.	Relocate to a museum where context can be added.
03/27/2018 20:33:23	Rob Larsen	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	I support adding context to the existing monuments as well as adding additional monuments that reflect the diversity of our Richmond citizens.
03/27/2018 20:57:34	Nicholas Shipman	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	While I approve of the mayor's proposal to add material contextualizing the monuments as an expression of incremental progress, I believe that ultimately the monuments will have to be removed. Hopefully a museum will want them. In any case, they should be removed for the same reason that the Allies removed monuments of Hitler and other prominent Nazis from across the former territories of the Third Reich. There is no convincing reason for taxpayer money to be apportioned to the glorification of defeated foes who sought to destroy our country. I would much prefer that my tax dollars be used for schools, where children can learn about the Confederacy from actual history textbooks rather than from vainglorious idols.
03/27/2018 21:05:36	Lisa Fleming	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	I was shocked when we moved to Virginia and saw these monuments. We should not honor these men. We should not forget our past either; the stories of these men belong in a museum.

03/27/2018 21:10:28	Cate Fitt	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Relocate the monuments.	The Confederate monuments were installed well after the Civil War. They were commissioned and put there to glorify a revisionist version of history, the Lost Cause. The reason for secession was preservation of slavery, not states' rights. The monuments should be removed and placed somewhere that their true purpose can be exposed and explained. Whilyou are at it, replace the Christopher Columbus statue by the Byrd Park tennis courts with the Arthur Ashe statue. Bring Monument Avenue into the 21st Century and help Richmond to become a place where we can speak honestly about the past.
03/27/2018 21:11:43	Brandon Simmons	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	Richmond needs to take a lead in telling a truthful story of the confederacy, slavery, and the civil war. The only appropriate thing is to remove them or radically alter (destroy) them in place.
03/27/2018 21:44:51	Bill Loving	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	In general I think the monuments should stay; however, the Commission should consider moving the Davis Monument, which seems to be most focused on glorifying the Confederacy, to a museum setting and creating a new monument in its place. If that is not practical, a monument facing it dealing with the struggle against Jim Crow/segregation might be appropriate.
03/27/2018 21:54:29	Nancy Carnan	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I believe the monuments should be moved to a Civil War battlefield. I do not want monuments celebrating people who worked to maintain their privileged livelihoods on the often broken backs of men, women and children to represent my city. Given that these statues were erected during the era of Jim Crow, when white supremacists in the south were fighting to maintain apartheid here, they have no place in a city dedicated to increasing diversity and community. What are we saying to our black friends and neighbors when these white men are lauded? And how could we "contextualize" these monuments, except by building tributes to the hundreds of thousands (of men beaten, tortured, and killed and women raped with their children torn out of their arms, and children abused) so high that these men are completely hidden by the consequences of their behaviors... We have the #1 public Sculpture department here at VCU. Let us replace these Civil War statues with those created by our award winning sculpture department!! Let us create statues reflecting the goals to which we aspire - images of problem-solvers and community leaders raising up everyone in our community! Germany demolished all statues of Hitler after WWII. We should at the very least remove these statues to a battlefield.
03/27/2018 21:59:19	Jennifer Robles	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	These statues represent an extreme distortion of history that must be corrected. They need to be removed to heal this cities divide, which exists!
03/27/2018 22:49:38	Joanna Pipes	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I favor relocation to private property.
03/28/2018 1:03:58	Rachael Belliveau	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	I think there is no excuse for these to still be up.
03/28/2018 7:07:53	Carol Schall	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	It is time to bid the old Richmond farewell and embrace RVA, a vibrant, diverse, welcoming city!

03/28/2018 8:44:06	Christopher Corbett	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Relocate the monuments.	As a child, my family drove down Monument Ave often. A game we played was naming the monuments. One day I asked "Who's sitting on Lee?" That was a child's mind. Now at 53, my mind has developed and I now see the real reason these monuments were erected. The glory of racism is what is represented! As a lifelong Richmonder, I say they have to go....Richmond must finally heal from Civil War and it's racist legacy,
03/28/2018 9:20:57	Kathryn Oti	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I'm a 30 year Fan resident and I lived in a house for 10 years overlooking the Lee Monument. I'm also a Certified Historic Preservationist and a Realtor who works primarily in historic neighborhoods. I think that most of the monuments should be moved to a museum sight. I would like to see the ICA, VMFA and the creative community in Richmond come up with appropriate public art for the spaces where the monuments now reside. I think it would be ok to keep just one monument to the civil war traitors and provide historical context in the form of signage explaining who it is and why it was put there. The rest of the avenue should celebrate positive history-makers from our shared heritage in Richmond along with other important features of our city such as THE ARTS, EDUCATION, BUSINESS, ARCHITECTURE, THE JAMES RIVER, EMANCIPATION, OUR 7 HILLS, etc. The monuments don't have to be about people.
03/28/2018 9:33:36	penelope greene	Leave the monuments as they are.	i don't support slavery. but i lived almost my whole life in richmond and i have always thought monument avenue was beautiful. i thought adding the arthur ashe monument was awkward and out of place. it's too modern to be grouped with the others. i'd relocate that one if i could. the others represent our history, right or wrong. those were the armies' heroes at the time of the war. they may have lost, or been in the wrong, but they stood up for their side of the argument and sacrificed a lot or everything for something they believed in. i think they should stay where they are as a testament to the lives of the men who fought for their country.
03/28/2018 9:51:03	Melissa Linkous	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	These monuments hurt people. They are not monuments to remember soldiers or lives lost. They were erected to belittle and suppress. A city should have the courage to change things that represent intolerance. Place them in a museum if you think they should be preserved or sell them and put the money into schools, parks, police, etc. I would love to see monuments that represent the beauty of this city - ciivil rights leaders, artistic sculptures to represent our thriving art scene, nature sculptures of native species of plants and animals, fountains, etc. I know that there are many sides to this issue, but the core of the decision should be with the feelings and hearts of people.. Why would you continue to have huge statements in your city that are hurtful to your residents? You can change it.
03/28/2018 9:51:40	David Shea	Add context to the monuments.	I love sculpture, I love Mounment Ave, what I don't love are the Generals. This is my plan, my advice, "remove the generals, leave the horses". The horses represent the best of the Civil War, the sacrifice the of 1.5 million horse and mules made in service to there human friends. Every horse slaughtered in that war had a human name given to that horse by the human that rode it. It's time we celebrated that bond. It's the horses that make the Mounment Ave sculptures so beautiful, not the Generals. Remove the Generals leave the Horses.
03/28/2018 10:16:12	Kristin Reed	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	In a historical moment when cities across the country have rightly rethought their decision to memorialize the individuals who fought for the right to enslave others, it is disheartening to see Richmond focus its energies on something so euphemistic as "adding context." Our monuments do not tell us an unedited version of history, they tell us how we wish to remember our shared past in the context of our present. They tell us who we wish to be. I do not wish to be a city that idolizes a racist history.
03/28/2018 11:11:32	rhea calpeno	Add context to the monuments.	Thank you!

03/28/2018 11:12:33	Philip G	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	<p>1. Acknowledge that the CSA was created to preserve slavery and white supremacy explicitly. Add either plaques to the states noting such or have re statues removed.</p> <p>2. Add statues to John Brown. and Nat Turner.</p> <p>3. Yes</p>
03/28/2018 11:19:02	Lesley Weatherford	Leave the monuments as they are., Add context to the monuments.	Add context or not, really doesn't matter to me but it couldn't hurt as many people have no idea what they are looking at. The folks who want them down were a very small group of people that influenced others to be on the team of the day in that opinion, as is so often how these things gain power. The relevance is not, to me, in the realm of what needs to be paid attention to right now. It just does not seem that important in the grand scheme of issues going on right now.
03/28/2018 11:27:55	Teresa Parr	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	<p>I attended VCU for 9 years and continue to work there part-time doing research and teaching. I now live in Hanover and commute to the city due to family concerns, but VCU and Richmond are an integral part of my community. I have been attending school board meetings in Hanover as they have discussed possibly changing the names of schools named after Confederates. For those against changing the names (including some school board members), there seems to be little empathy for what it must be like (and, they heard and read many heart wrenching stories) for students whose ancestors were enslaved to attend those schools. Clearly those for and against were talking right past each other. Listening to the various points of view and hearing all the misinformation (and missing information/context), made it abundantly clear to me that we have not done the work we need to do to move past/forward from the legacy of slavery. I know many in Richmond are doing this work, but how can we fully move forward when statues honoring those who committed treason, who supported slavery exist? We need to make the statement that we want to move forward, address these issues. We need to build trust that we are committed to that. Removing the statues is an essential step in that process. We can problem solve the related issues once we have made that decision. We can look to how other countries with histories of similar atrocities handled their statues and reconciliation afterwards. Clearly, removing the statues does not amount to erasing history. Instead, it is a way of truly acknowledging it. We can find ways to improve our understanding of the history - all aspects of it, not just a one-sided view. We can look to what others have done there too. There are some beautiful and healing approaches that we could use. Many are talking about the costs associated with removing the statues, but we can figure out how to manage those (after subtracting the costs associated with maintenance). Perhaps donations could be procured. We must also consider the costs of keeping them - human and financial. Let's not leave this to our kids.</p>
03/28/2018 16:51:57	Mary Coiner	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I think the monuments should be moved to historically appropriate places, such as Appomattox for Robert E. Lee or a battlefield for Stonewall Jackson. An informative plaque could be placed where the monument was, telling about that person's role in history and where the monument was moved to. In their place could be monuments to African Americans or others who made significant contributions to civil rights and racial equality. We already have Arthur Ashe. Possible additions could be Barack Obama, Jackie Robinson, Harriet Tubman, Thurgood Marshall, Abraham Lincoln. This would be a fitting replacement, and we would still have a wonderful Monument Avenue. Thanks for the opportunity to share my thoughts.

03/28/2018 16:54:39	Michael Way Jr.	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.	<p>At the end of the day, the statues are really a matter of credible manners and good taste, aren't they? It's a matter of basic friendliness, towards neighbors sharing a common home. If your daddy tries to kill my daddy, I really do want to believe you're personally sorry for what your daddy did. I want to believe you're sorry so we can be friends, maybe go bowling, make Big Lebowski references, and see who does a better Sam Elliot impression.</p> <p>But I can't believe you are sorry for trying to kill my daddy when you're keeping a big statue in front of the house, celebrating your daddy for that time he tried to kill my daddy, especially when it's a house where we both live and pay bills. That doesn't look like something people do when they're sorry. That doesn't look like something people do when they who wants to be friends.</p> <p>I want to believe your daddy's attempt to kill my daddy is behind us because you personally seem cool, like somebody who might be a cool friend. But friends don't let friends drive drunk, and they especially don't celebrate the time their daddy tried to kill their friend's daddy. They don't try to make their friend feel bad about not wanting to see the time their daddy was almost killed made into a trophy. What an interesting alternate reality we've created, where the act of feeling disrespected or suggesting we stop the disrespect is somehow disrespectful. That's the attempt to kill my daddy we're talking about, by your daddy. Immortalized as a trophy. Put in a super public spot so all can see how proud *you* are of your trophy. One of the defining features of your home, *our* home is a trophy celebrating the time your daddy tried to kill my daddy? The only way to honor *your* daddy is to co-sign onto the disrespect of mine? That's not credible manners. That's not good taste. That's not what friends do.</p> <p>If one looks around Richmond I think you can sense that this is a naturally warm and friendly city. People are so cool, sometimes it almost seems like one could grab almost anyone and start a lifelong friendship. We all want to be friends. But you gotta give us something to work with. Show yourselves friendly.</p>
---------------------	-----------------	--	--

What to Do with Monument Avenue

In framing recommendations and feedback for the Mayor concerning the future of the monumental confederate celebrations on Monument Avenue, the Commission should avoid simply detailing a laundry list of suggestions for coping with these oppressive statues. Instead, it should offer descriptions of the meanings of these confederate celebrations that it has learned from the public forums its members have attended and lay out what the commission may gather as points of consensus of these meanings and impacts. With that as background, the Commission must offer alternatives that offer true balance to the century-long celebration of confederate icons.

Signification of Location and Scale

These statues stand in the center of Monument Avenue, at the center of traffic circles. Monument Avenue has become a center of one of Richmond's wealthiest residential areas, and the City of Richmond has responsibility for maintaining what is essentially the front yards of many of the residences on the avenue. Drivers must navigate traffic circles surrounding these statues at intersections of major cross streets, so drivers on Monument Avenue, North Lombardy Street, North Allen Avenue, North Davis Avenue, North Boulevard, and North Belmont Avenue. The central locations of these statues and their surrounding traffic circles enforce drivers' attention to them while traveling on each of these six streets. The same holds for pedestrians, particularly at the Lee and Stuart circles where walkers must travel significantly out of a direct route to move through those intersections.

These statues and their pedestals are enormous in scale. The Lee statue rises approximately 61 feet from its base, and the Davis statue and surrounding confederate celebration stand 67 feet high, but even the Maury statue stands at about 27 feet high. They each demand that viewers look up in subordinate postures to take them in.

The centrality and scale of each of these statues demand that any efforts to "contextualize" each statue must command the same sets of characteristics. I question the possibility of adding context that can balance the overarching oppressiveness of the statues' presence, individually and as a group. Nevertheless, I'll offer a few suggestions, more as possible themes for contextualization than concrete suggestions.

The Current Context

Beginning in 1890, Monument Avenue and its statues reflected victory for the Redeemer movement in the south, culminating in the often violent overthrow of state and local often integrated Republican majority governments and the institution of Jim Crow. As an opus, the avenue and its statuary are best represented by the statue at the pinnacle of the Davis assemblage, Vindicatrix (presumably signifying vindication), or Miss Confederacy. Any attempt at adding context to the avenue requires equally compelling representations of the values espoused in the rebellion. The Davis assembly remembers his claim to "defending our rights." But the only right enshrined in confederate institutions that confederates felt they lacked as citizens of the United States was the right to enslave Africans and African Americans, to plunder their labor, to commodify their children, to torture them, to rape them, and to kill them at will. Vindicatrix, the Redeemers' success, represents the extra-legal reinstatement of many of these "rights" of white people under a new banner, Jim Crow.

Contextualizing Monument Avenue requires monumental depictions of the outcomes from the right confederates claimed to counter the heroic false narrative currently in place.

Contextualizing the Statues

Any new context's signification must be as clear, straightforward, easy to get, both up close and from afar, as the signification of the statues. The context must

- Be monumental
- Be apparent to drivers traveling by at 25 miles per hour

03/28/2018 21:45:36	Mark Wood	Relocate the monuments.	They should be moved to a museum or park with other Confederate/Civil War monuments. The areas they now occupy can be made into concert venues and/or be replaced by new monuments to southerners who fought on the winning side of human rights or to artistic works that symbolize such values as democracy,, liberty, peace, creativity, and so on.
03/29/2018 7:37:56	Carl Shuler Jr	Leave the monuments as they are.	Leave them be. they were never an issue till as of late, and they make "Monument Ave" Monument Ave.
03/29/2018 9:32:17	Alexandra Saxton	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	<p>I am most strongly in favor of relocating the monuments. I think it would be difficult to add context to them in a meaningful way in their current location. I typically see them when driving, so an added informational plaque would not have an effect. I have two children, and it is difficult to explain to them why we have these immense statues of generals who lost a war, because the logical implication is the war should have been won. I find it naive to believe that those who installed the monuments felt otherwise.</p> <p>If new statues are added to the avenue, I think they should match the grandeur of the existing statues. The Arthur Ash statue is, aesthetically, very disappointing. It is a shame that the existing CSA statues have such a dubious background, because they are beautiful. I doubt it is possible, but my 5 year old has suggested taking the men off the statues and leaving the horses.</p> <p>There are so many Virginians and Americans worthy of commemoration. I see no reason to idolize these men in particular. I grew up with tales of the War of Northern Aggression and the personality cult of General Lee, and I also grew up hearing that the Holocaust was a hoax and that blacks were better off under slavery. That I heard both lines of commentary from the same people is more than a coincidence. Please be honest and transparent in your consideration of what these statues represent.</p>
03/29/2018 12:07:32	Eleanor Kaiser	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	I think all civil war tourist attractions should be in one place. don't we already have a lovely place at Tredagar iron works.? (oops not sure of spelling) leave all the plinths they rest on, bare and in situ. a fitting reminder of history and all it can tell us. hope for a peaceful and inspired outcome from your commision. eleanor kaiser
03/29/2018 12:16:39	MAria Rose	Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.	The whole story should be told about the monuments and how they were placed there WELL after the war and we should look at other Richmond individuals that have contributed to the success of the community.
03/29/2018 12:37:44	Sally Kutz	Leave the monuments as they are.	This is my choice
03/29/2018 16:33:18	Patsy King	Add context to the monuments.	Bringing the Borders Exhibit to Richmond could bring a sense of peace and healing to our city. It travels for a year at a time and costs roughly \$40,000 to host the exhibit.
03/29/2018 18:17:09	Julie Jackson	Leave the monuments as they are., Add context to the monuments.	The monuments bring in tourists and tax dollars. they beautify the city. They are art. Art is supposed to be controversial. They should not be removed, however the idea of adding context to the monuments is a viable option. Adding more monuments is also another good option.
03/30/2018 11:05:03	Thomas Raper	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments.	<p>Primarily my wish would be to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * remove all monuments except Lee * in empty spaces, by using a master plan, begin to fill in these gaps with local/state heroes of all genders and races <p>If removal is not possible - add context (sculptures, figures, signage, artwork) that tastefully challenges and humanizes the struggles of the oppressed - and how they have overcome and thrived despite the odds/war heroes, etc</p>

03/30/2018 11:08:56	Holly Chasan-Young	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.	If relocation isn't possible than remove. But I think it's possible.
03/30/2018 14:09:16	Forrest Young	Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Relocate the monuments.	Unless a prominent message is added to each and every confederate statue on Monument Avenue detailing the full and true nature of their history, similar to the content of mayor Mitch Landrieu's speech regarding New Orleans' statues, they ought to be relocated to a museum where they should be accompanied by such contextual analysis. The public, now and future, deserves to be made aware of how these sculptures of stone have been a source of pain to the persecuted and of pride to the racially prejudiced. As lies that are passed down find their echoes in these mute statues, the latter group will continue to misinterpret treason and mass-murder for heroism and gallantry. Educate in place or relocate where the same can done elsewhere. Stop the decades long pretense that our entire city and its visitors should involuntarily honor those who would have had us all enslaved to ideals of which are racist, unpatriotic, and wrong.
03/30/2018 15:18:21	Asher Burns	Add context to the monuments.	By 'add context,' I mean get rid of references to "General" Robert E. Lee, "General" Thomas Jackson, "General" JEB Stuart. We should honor them for their achievements as Americans, not Confederates, thus "Colonel" Robert E Lee, "Colonel" Thomas Jackson, and "Captain" JEB Stuart. We should get rid of the Jeff Davis memorial, he wasn't even from Virginia, but we should keep Matthew Maury. Adding more statues might be cool, but it's probably too expensive. Maybe only one, preferably of a black Virginia civil war veteran, such as Sgt. William Harvey Carney, who was born in VA but escaped to MA.